

MULTIPLE DIVISION OF THE OCTAVE AND THE TONAL  
RESOURCES OF 19-TONE TEMPERAMENT

BY

M. JOEL MANDELBAUM

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the Doctor of Philosophy degree  
in the Graduate School  
Indiana University  
June, 1961

Accepted by the faculty of the Graduate School,  
Indiana University, in partial fulfillment of the require-  
ments for the Doctor of Philosophy degree.

Charles Kent  
Director of Thesis

Doctoral Committee:

Charles Kent, Chairman  
William F. Johnson  
William F. Johnson  
John H. Johnson  
John H. Johnson  
Frank Kent

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I am grateful to the chairman of my committee, Dr. Charles S. Kent, for his painstaking care in reading through my manuscript in its various stages, and to the other members of my committee for their suggestions and corrections.

In addition, I am deeply indebted to a number of outstanding musicians and experts on subjects related to this paper whose generous contributions of time provided invaluable encouragement as well as information. Joseph Yesser, one of the pioneers in the field of 19-tone temperament, discussed this project with me on three separate occasions, and made available his file of correspondence on the subject. Harry Partch put at my disposal his superb instrument collection and discussed his own researches with me at considerable length. Dr. Fritz Kuttner similarly devoted considerable time to imparting information gathered in research for an eventual record release on multiple division by Musurgia Records.

I am indebted for help through correspondence to Prof. Adriaan Pokker of Holland, Prof. Viggo Brun of Norway, to Prof. Leigh Gardine of St. Louis, and to Robert W. Young and Tillman Schafer of San Diego.

The following libraries were kind enough to supply materials on Interlibrary Loan: Boston Public Library;

University of Cincinnati; Library of Congress; Harvard University; University of Michigan; University of North Carolina; Oberlin College; University of Oregon; Peabody Institute; Free Library of Philadelphia; Western Reserve University.

Charts were prepared by Ellen Mandelbaum who also assisted in several other capacities.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
PART ONE: REASONS FOR THE ADVOCACY OF MULTIPLE DIVISION . . . . .	1
1. THE ACOUSTICAL BASIS FOR MULTIPLE DIVISION . . . . .	3
Theories of Consonance and Dissonance . . . . .	4
Intervals:	
The Octave . . . . .	9
The 3rd Partial: The Perfect Fifth and Fourth . . . . .	14
The 5th Partial: Thirds and Sixths . . . . .	26
The Web of Fifths and Thirds . . . . .	36
The 7th Partial . . . . .	53
The Higher Partials . . . . .	68
The Acoustical Position of 12-Tone Tempera- ment . . . . .	75
The Acoustical Position of 19-Tone Tempera- ment . . . . .	77
2. HISTORICAL PRECEDENTS FOR MULTIPLE DIVISION . . . . .	79
The Greeks . . . . .	80
Just Intonation . . . . .	88
Meantone and Other Sub-Comma Temperaments . . . . .	96
A Brief Note on Oriental and Folk Music . . . . .	112
Conclusion . . . . .	114
3. MULTIPLE DIVISION AS THE RESULT OF EVOLUTION . . . . .	116
Intonation Systems by Historical Dialectic . . . . .	118
Implied Reservations about Contemporary Practice . . . . .	120
Gradual Development and Interperformability . . . . .	126
Signs of Change . . . . .	129
PART TWO: THE WRITINGS OF THE ADVOCATES OF MULTIPLE DIVISION . . . . .	134
4. MULTIPLE DIVISION BASED ON 12-TONE TEMPERA- MENT . . . . .	135

Chapter	Page
The Basis for 24-Tone Temperament . . . . .	156
More Than 24 Tones . . . . .	160
5. EQUAL TEMPERAMENT BASED ON FIFTHS AND THIRDS . . . . .	169
Section 1: Positive Systems . . . . .	169
Bosanquet's General Theory of the Octave . . . . .	170
Where $\frac{p}{q}$ Equals 1 . . . . .	176
53-Tone Temperament . . . . .	182
Where $\frac{p}{q}$ Equals 2 . . . . .	192
Section 2: Negative Systems . . . . .	195
Where $\frac{p}{q}$ Equals -1 . . . . .	195
Where $\frac{p}{q}$ Equals -2: 50-Tone Temperament . . . . .	200
31-Tone Equal Temperament . . . . .	201
Current Practice in 31-Tone Temperament . . . . .	216
6. UNUSUAL SUGGESTIONS FOR EQUAL TEMPERAMENTS . . . . .	219
"Ideal Systems" . . . . .	219
Systems Without Fifths or Thirds or Both . . . . .	224
7. MULTIPLE DIVISION WITHOUT EQUAL TEMPERAMENT . . . . .	226
Perrett . . . . .	228
Partch . . . . .	234
8. THE ANTECEDENTS AND EARLY ADVOCACY OF 19- TONE TEMPERAMENT . . . . .	246
Salinas and $1/3$ -Comma Temperament . . . . .	247
Woolhouse . . . . .	252
Opelt . . . . .	255
Sachs . . . . .	256
Kowalenkow . . . . .	259
Härschmidt . . . . .	262
9. TEORVALD KORNERUP . . . . .	267
Pure Thirds Alter a Second . . . . .	269
Historical Justifications . . . . .	271
The Golden System . . . . .	272
10. "ARIEL" . . . . .	282

Chapter	Page
The 59 Basic Intervals . . . . .	282
The Four Requirements of a Tonal System . . . . .	284
The Interrelation and Evolution of Tonal Systems . . . . .	293
Cult of Numbers . . . . .	297
Summary . . . . .	298
11. JOSEPH YASSER . . . . .	299
Tonality, Modality, and the Principle of Diatonicity . . . . .	300
The Variability of Just Intonation . . . . .	303
The Dissonant Second and the Consonant Third . . . . .	304
Equal Temperament . . . . .	308
The Influence of Yasser's Theory . . . . .	310
12. AN ACOUSTICAL COMPARISON OF 19-TONE SYSTEMS . . . . .	313
Three Additional Systems Proposed . . . . .	322
The Importance of Just Tunings to Temperament . . . . .	327
Consonance and Dissonance in 19-Tone Temperament . . . . .	329
Miscellaneous Data and Conjectures About 19-Tone Temperament . . . . .	330
Criticisms of Nineteen-Tone Temperament . . . . .	333
13. GENERAL DISCUSSION OF METHODS FOR CHOOSING A SYSTEM OF MULTIPLE DIVISION AND SOME CONCLUSIONS . . . . .	337
Methods of Choice: Trial and Error . . . . .	352
Mathematical Methods . . . . .	362
Professor Brun's Method . . . . .	370
Applying Brun's Process to Other Intervals . . . . .	379
Conclusion . . . . .	381
PART THREE: HYPOTHETICAL AND EXPERIMENTAL MATERIALS . . . . .	384
14. A THEORY OF HARMONY BASED ON SYMMETRICAL SCALES WITH QUASI-EQUAL INTERVALS IN 19-TONE TEMPERAMENT . . . . .	384
The Gamut . . . . .	384
Consonance and Dissonance . . . . .	385

Chapter	Page
Harmonic Sonorities . . . . .	386
The Formation of Scales . . . . .	387
A More Detailed Treatment of Harmonic Sonorities . . . . .	396
The Tendency of Intervals . . . . .	400
Conclusion . . . . .	403
 15. NINE PRELUDES FOR TWO PIANOS IN 19-TONE EQUAL TEMPERAMENT . . . . .	 405
I. Allegro Maestoso . . . . .	406
II. Un poco lento . . . . .	408
III. Allegretto . . . . .	408
IV. Maestoso e brillante . . . . .	411
V. Two Chorales: lento; un poco meno lento . . . . .	412
VI. Moderato espressivo . . . . .	415
VII. Allegretto . . . . .	416
VIII. Allegro Moderato . . . . .	419
IX. Vivace . . . . .	421
Brief Analytical Notes . . . . .	425
 SUPPLEMENT: THE GENERALIZED KEYBOARD . . . . .	 433
GLOSSARY . . . . .	443
BIBLIOGRAPHY . . . . .	450



# TABLE OF RECORDED ILLUSTRATIONS

Number	Page
1. The 19-Tone Scale . . . . .	xv
2. Stockhausen's Scale Based on the 25th Root of 5 . . . . .	10
3. The Major 3rd: Just and Pythagorean . . . .	29
4. The Minor 3rd: Just and Pythagorean . . . .	34
5. The Major Triad: Just and Pythagorean . . .	29
6. The Minor Triad: Just and Pythagorean . . .	34
7. Just Sonorities with the 7th Partial:	
Dominant seventh, 4:5:6:7 . . . . .	61
Half-diminished seventh, $\frac{1}{7} \frac{1}{6} \frac{1}{5} \frac{1}{4}$ . . . . .	62
Septimal Minor Triad, 6:7:9 . . . . .	63
Septimal Major Triad . . . . 14:18:21 . . .	64
8. Pentachords with the 11th partial:	
8:9:10:11:12 and $\frac{1}{12} \frac{1}{11} \frac{1}{10} \frac{1}{9} \frac{1}{8}$ . . . . .	69
9. The Alleged "Scriabine" Chord, 8:10:11:13: 14:18 . . . . .	131
10. The Equivalent in 19-Tone Temperament . . . .	131
11. Wyschnegradsky's Progression of Example 25 a.	145
12. Wyschnegradsky's Neutral Triad . . . . .	146
13. Krenek's 13-Tone Scale . . . . .	224
14. Ferrett: Example 37, the Second Progression.	233
15. Sachs: Three Deceptive Cadences . . . . .	258
16. 9:8 and 10:9 Compared . . . . .	286

Number		Page
17.	16:9 and 9:5 Compared . . . . .	286
18.	Nine Preludes for Two Pianos in 19-Tone Temperament . . . . .	406-424

## PREFACE

The proper role of the music theorist and the proper relationship of musical theory to practice have been subjects of frequent controversy. Much of the preoccupation of music theory is with the music of the past. Speculation on a possible future course for music involves the risk of serious error. The breaking of ground for new musical patterns of construction seems a particularly speculative preoccupation, and yet a number of theorists have accepted just this as their primary task.

It is the basic presupposition behind this study that inquiry into possible new directions for musical development represents theory in its most creative and constructive role. It would seem reasonable to suppose that in a field as vast and relatively unexplored as the multiple division of the octave there must be misconceptions to be swept away and complications to be simplified so that the creative musician might eventually be able to make a choice based neither on ignorance nor on fear of the unknown.

It was the initial purpose of this study to make a thorough investigation of one of the possible kinds of multiple division, 19-tone equal temperament, only. It became apparent on investigation, however, that the entire field of multiple division had received insufficient comprehensive examination or evaluation since Bosanquet in 1875,

and that as specific a study as was contemplated would be without any link to the body of general knowledge. There is almost nothing in recent literature more specific than the single-chapter references of J. Murray Barbour<sup>1</sup> yet more general than the passionate advocacy of individual systems by such writers as Wärschmidt, Wyschnegradsky, Fokker, and Partch.<sup>2</sup>

My purpose is, therefore, to present a general picture of the field of multiple division of the octave as it exists today. In partial retention of the original intent of the study, 19-tone temperament will be emphasized and studied in more detail than the other systems.

#### WHAT IS 19-TONE TEMPERAMENT?

19-tone temperament, as its name indicates, is the division of the octave into nineteen equal parts instead of the twelve equal parts into which it is divided in common

---

<sup>1</sup>J. Murray Barbour, Tuning and Temperament, the most widely recognized work in this country on tuning systems in general.

<sup>2</sup>The works of these writers are listed in the bibliography and are studied in the various chapters of this text. It should be noted that several books have dealt at greater than one-chapter length with multiple division. Augusto Novarro's Sistema Natural de la Música contains many interesting insights into a number of recently explored systems of multiple division, while Partch and Fokker have looked with considerable sympathy into proposed systems of multiple division other than their own. Their works are useful to the student of multiple division as primers, but they explore at best only a few of the problems and possibilities inherent in the field as a whole.

practice. Since the octave is an abstract quality produced by two sounds whose vibration frequencies are to one another as the relationship 2 to 1, it follows that the octave can be divided into as many parts as one wishes, just as it is possible to divide the abstract number 2 into as many fractional parts as one wishes.<sup>3</sup>

The vibration ratio of the smallest interval in 19-tone temperament is approximately equal to the superparticular ratio 28:27, and exactly equal to the repeating decimal fraction  $\overline{63.1578947368421052}$  cents.<sup>4</sup> The interval in 12-tone temperament which has its closest equivalent in 19-tone temperament is the perfect fifth (together with its inversion the perfect fourth), which is approximately 5% cents larger than its 19-tone equivalent (which will also be called a "perfect fifth"). To find the discrepancy between corresponding intervals of the two temperaments it is possible to use the circle of fifths, adding 5% cents for each fifth used.

There are many ways the intervals might be named and

---

<sup>3</sup>These subdivisions of the number 2 may be equal arithmetically, geometrically, or exponentially, or they may be not equal by any method. In 19-tone temperament the subdivisions are geometrically equal, since the systems represents the 19-fold geometric division of the ratio 2:1. The smallest unit is  $\frac{1}{19}$ .

<sup>4</sup>This figure is given by Charles S. Kent in An Introduction to Tuning and Temperament. He gives the value in cents for the smallest interval of all of the commonly proposed temperaments, in every case obtaining a repeated decimal fraction.

the pitches notated. As it would seem particularly to be desired that this study be easily understood by musicians whose entire experience has been with standard diatonic nomenclature, this same nomenclature will be applied to 19-tone temperament throughout this study. Traditional enharmonic equivalences must, in this process, be cancelled out while other enharmonic equivalences are created.  $C\sharp$  and  $D\flat$  are, in 19-tone temperament, distinct pitches, while  $E\sharp$  and  $F\flat$  are one and the same. In Example 1, below, the names of pitches and intervals in the 19-tone system are compared to those of 12-tone temperament.

#### PRELIMINARY ABBREVIATIONS AND DEFINITIONS

It has proved necessary to use a few uncommon abbreviations or new words for concepts which must be referred to repeatedly and the full description of which in customary language would be most cumbersome.

The smallest interval in any equal-tempered system will be referred to as a unit of that particular system, since the term "semitone" is ambiguous where more than 12 tones are used.

Since it is often necessary to refer to intervals both as units of a temperament and as just ratios, the following procedure has been adopted. Whenever a just ratio is intended, the two numbers are separated by a colon:

## EXAMPLE 1

## 19-TONE

## 12-TONE

Name of  
tone

Interval from C

Cents

Cents

Interval from C

Name of  
tone

C	perfect prime	00	00	perfect prime	C
C#	aug. prime-dim. 2nd	63	—	minor second	Db (C#)
Db	minor second	126	—	major second	D
D	major second	189	—	minor third	Eb (D#)
D#	aug. 2nd-dim. 3rd	253	—	major third	E
Eb	minor third	316	—	perfect fourth	F
E	major third	379	—	aug. 4th; dim. 5th	F#-Gb
E#-Fb	aug. 3rd-dim. 4th	442	—	perfect fifth	G
F	perfect fourth	505	—	minor sixth	Ab (G#)
F#	augmented fourth	568	—	major sixth	A
Gb	diminished fifth	632	—	minor seventh	Bb (A#)
G	perfect fifth	695	—	major seventh	B
G#	aug. 5th-dim. 6th	758	—	perfect octave	c
Ab	minor sixth	821	—		
A	major sixth	884	—		
A#	aug. 6th-dim. 7th	947	—		
Bb	minor seventh	1011	—		
B	major seventh	1074	—		
B#-Cb	aug. 7th-dim. 8th	1137	—		
c	perfect octave	1200	—		

3:2. Whenever a logarithmic fraction is intended, the two numbers are separated by a virgule:  $7/12$ . In the absence of any designation of which interval such a configuration of numbers is the logarithmic fraction, it may be assumed that it is of an octave.

Terms pertaining to specific chapters will be introduced at the beginnings of those chapters, and I have tried to include all unfamiliar concepts and terms in a glossary which appears on page 443.